Four major literary code-switching strategies in Hungarian literature. Decoding monolingualism

Johanna DOMOKOS

Károli Gáspár University of the Reformed Church in Hungary / Bielefeld
University

Marianna DEGANUTTI

FMSP, Goethe University Frankfurt

johanna.domokos@uni-bielefeld.de, mariannadeganutti5@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The field of literary multilingualism has quickly grown over the last decades. Multiple studies have examined the way linguistic diversity manifests itself in literature by focusing on specific strategies such as code-switching, code-mixing, code-shifting, hybridization, etc. However, the current understanding of multilingual practices is still dominated by a remarkable terminological inconsistency. In this article, we provide a new theoretical framework called ‘literary code-switching’ (Domokos 2018–2020), that can be used to examine most literary multilingual practices – from the most hidden or latent to the more manifest ones. This formulation, which is scaled into degrees from 0 to 5, will be applied to some key examples taken from the works of Imre Madách, Mihály Tompa, Imre Oravecz, Attila Jász, Ferenc Karinthy, Terézia Mora and Anne Tardos. The aim of picking up these heuristic examples from Hungarian literature is to point towards the necessity of investigating literature more systematically according to its hidden and manifest linguistic diversity.

Keywords: code-switching, literary multilingualism, Hungarian literature, zero degree code-switching, intrasentential and intersentential code-switching

Introduction

A growing interest in literary multilingualism has emerged over the last decades. Despite the prevalence of national literatures circumscribed by the parameter of monolingualism (Gramling 2016, Yıldız 2012), the interest in linguistic diversity has created a parallel multilingual canon, which transcends the nation-state paradigm. This means that literary scholars have progressively focused on reading texts composed

in multiple languages or written by authors who have used more than one language in separate works, sometimes – as in the case of exilic or migrant writers – choosing to employ acquired tongues instead of their first language(s).

Strongly influenced by specific socio-linguistic, narratology or philology studies, these multilingual literary practices have been classified in multiple ways. Among the most popular definitions, the following stand out: “polylinguaging” (Jørgensen et al. 2011), “polylingualism”, (Sternberg 1982), “polyglot literature” (Beardsmore 1978), “heterolingualism” (Grutman 2012), “exophony” (Susan Arndt, Dirk Naguschewski and Robert Stockhammer 2007), “semiodiversity” (Gramling 2016), “translingualism” (Garcia 2013), “literary transnationalism” (Kellman 2015), etc. These notions have sometimes been used interchangeably but have also highlighted different nuances of the same practice. The result is that there is “no coherent, agreed-upon terminology, either within or across specific disciplines (or languages)” (Yildiz: 213).

In addition to these notions, scholars have also tried to focus more in detail on different multilingual practices: “Since the 1970s, a large amount of research in the field of bilingualism has focused on the mixing of languages in discourse, in particular code-switching and related phenomena, variously called code-mixing, code-shifting, language alternation or language interaction” (Sebba 97). This list could also be extended to hybridization, interference, and more (Berruto 1998). Even though fewer studies have been dedicated to written (and literary) practices (Callahan 2004; Sebba 2012; Gardner-Chloros and Weston 2015; Delabastita and Grutman 2008; Baldo 2019) than to oral ones, in this case the result has also been a terminological disarray. Bearing in mind the rhetorical argument of Paul de Man in *Semiotics and Rhetoric* (1973) or such deconstructive philosophical studies as Jacques Derrida’s *Monolingualism of the Other* (1998) still it follows that the analytic tools we possess today to approach literary multilingual texts appear rather fragmented, as well as confusing.

In this paper, we aim to provide an innovative literary linguistic framework that can be used to cover most literary multilingual practices. These practices may vary considerably according to the way multiple languages are qualitatively and quantitatively employed and defined in their works by writers. As suggested by Grutman, “texts can either give equal prominence to two (or more) languages or add a liberal sprinkling of other languages to a dominant language clearly identified as their central axis” (19). Within the same multilingual literary category would therefore belong both texts such as *El desdichado* by Gérard de Nerval or *Harmonia celestis* by Péter Esterházy, whose titles are in a different language than the rest of the book, as well as works which include wider multilingual insertions “taking up entire paragraphs or even pages, as in Tolstoy’s *War and peace* and Sterne’s *Tristram Shandy*” (cursive in the original) (Grutman 19). Furthermore, a multilingual text could feature

multilingualism in an even more remarkable way, for instance blurring the boundary between the matrix and embedded languages, such as in Anne Tardos's quadrilingual, László Baránszky's bilingual or Cia Rinne's homophonic multilingual poetries. This brief list obviously confounds multilingual practices of different orders, which are probably not suited to being inserted within the same theoretical framework.

Our framework, named "literary code-switching", was first theorized in Domokos 2018–2020. It satisfies the need to accommodate all these heterogeneous strategies, starting from so-called hidden or latent multilingual practices – referring to works in which languages could still be present even when they are not immediately perceptible (Keller 1979; Radaelli 2011; Dembeck 2017; Blum-Barth 2020) – to the most openly expressed or manifest multilingual forms. According to this formulation, code-switching corresponds to several different practices, which are scaled into degrees from 0 to 5 and subdivided into further categories. Given that our theoretical framework concerns code-switching, we will first introduce the way in which it is interpreted in this analysis. Secondly, we will focus in more detail on the 0 to 3 code-switching types, their subcategories, and on the way, they depict different communicative levels in a wide variety of texts, to show how the poetics of code-switching contributes to manifesting localities, linguistic diversities, multicultural memories, and more. The sound poetry of Hungarian artists such as Endre Szkárosi and Katalin Ladik contain examples of the 4th and 5th degrees of code-switching, but they will be examined at a later stage of our research.

The examples given below aim to highlight manifestations of code-switching not yet discussed in Hungarian scholarship, which otherwise effectively deals with the multilingualism of contemporary retrospective novels, reflecting the multilingual and multicultural dynamism of the Central and Eastern European landscape. Such prosaic and poetic literary works, often authored by internationally recognized writers such as Ottó Tolnai, Péter Esterházy, Ádám Bodor, Pál Závada, György Dragomár, Vince Fekete or Andrea Tompa, "create localized perspectives by transforming historical conflicting strata into a vernacular memory, which gives birth to an accented (dispersed) contemporary reader experience" (Dánél, 2021, 55, our translation). There is no question, then, that these novels written with "fluctuating grammar" and "multilingual self-awareness" (as Beáta Thomka formulates, 2018, 146.) form the most obvious code-switching core of contemporary Hungarian literature.

Code-switching

Code-switching is usually described by linguists as "the use of several languages or dialects in the same conversation or sentence by bilingual people" (Gardner-Chloros 2009: 4). It is also defined as "the alternative

use by bilinguals of two or more languages in the same conversation” which could “occur between the turn of different speakers in conversation, sometimes even within a single utterance” (Milroy and Muysken 7–8). The situations described by Gardner-Chloros and Milroy and Muysken happen on a daily basis in multiple societies around the world, given that multilingualism constitutes the normal condition rather than an exception. Apart from being constantly used in day-to-day life, code-switching is also a popular tool employed by writers belonging to the most disparate literary traditions. Writers who could use more than one linguistic code in their works, such as multilingual and transnational authors, have exploited the potential of this tool since ancient times. As Filonov Gove (1973) points out:

In literature, code-switching is potentially available to any writer who commands another language besides his own and is not restricted from its use by literary canon. Practitioners of code-switching in the West include Petronius and Cicero, medieval translators, Rabelais and Montaigne, Sterne, Tolstoy, Pound, Eliot, Joyce, E. E. Cummings, Hemingway, and Anthony Burgess (79).

Code-switching has been used by writers, for instance, to deal with encounters with individuals possessing different linguistic and cultural backgrounds. If we consider specific literary genres such as migrant literature, travelogues, borderland novels, folkloric tales, epic poems and even comic series and oral poetry, these multilingual or multicultural encounters and contacts may easily occur. In Gardner-Chloros’ words, code-switching “affects practically everyone who is in contact with more than one language or dialect, to a greater or lesser extent” (2009: 4). Not to mention that a different linguistic background could materialise even in apparent monolingual backgrounds – it is enough for a character to study a foreign language at university, such as in the Slovene classic *Cvetje v jeseni* (1917) by Ivan Tavčar, in which Elvira talks to her mother in French, one of the languages she has learnt during her studies.

Functions of literary code-switching

The present paper defines literary code-switching as an aesthetic play with multiple formal elements and/or semantic interpretations, not limited to mimetic function. An example of the mimetic function of code-switching is given by Callahan (2004: 90), who specifies that the use of this function in Chicano literature often derives from the need to portray characters’ real way of talking, especially when code-switching is embedded into dialogues:

Codeswitching in these works, then, reproduces the speech of individuals who would be expected to codeswitch. Codeswitching in the main narrative could be said to be an extension of this: the author's own sociolinguistic background predicts his or her use of codeswitching (90).

While this may appear to be the most obvious function of code-switching practices, it should not be forgotten that literary code-switching differs considerably from oral code-switching; it is a fictional tool used by writers to achieve their narratorial goals. As Rainier Grutman underlines: "Mimetic readings do not explain how languages interact with each other within the boundaries of texts whose use of foreign tongues quite often goes beyond mirroring society or supposedly 'translating' reality" (2006: 19). This is the reason why, for instance, Joyce's *Ulysses* or *Finnegans Wake* should be considered "neither the product nor the reflection of a multilingual environment" (Grutman 1999: 41).

Indeed, the fact that speakers can draw their speech upon more than one code leads to the possibility of conveying meanings, data and nuance that a single code cannot. Code-switching is, in other words, also a way to provide information – from the geographic, social and political circumstances of a specific context to the state of mind of a character or the way it interacts with others – that is implied in the language used. Additionally, literary code-switching has to do with the way the different communicative levels (e.g., the communication between the author and the reader, between the narrator and the addressee, and between the characters) interact between themselves, justifying the use of a certain tongue rather than another. For this reason, it is "of great interest *how*, *when* and *why* targeted linguistic elements from phonemes to larger linguistic units and even alphabets or semantic meanings are selected and combined in a literary work" (Domokos 2018: 85). By considering the way in which these communicative levels work, we can better understand code-switching's functions, given that it may "repeal linguistic and cultural barriers, de-automate semantic production, address the appropriation of linguistic, aesthetic and cultural diversity, and efficiently stage alterity" (Domokos 2020: 44). Beyond this, code-switching is a productive method of staging locality. As Móna Dánél points out in her analysis of the work of Hungarian authors in multiple cultural areas:

The remaining differences of linguistic distinctness and accents imbued with various geographical, historical, cultural and social localities can be poetically evaluated, while their local attachments do not disappear and are not hierarchized. Such a comparison can keep and maintain local differences, which are never

purely local but arise in cultural intersections, in the dynamic space of the commensurable-incommensurable duality (2020, 10, our translation).

To approach code-switching, in this paper we apply Domokos' 0 to 5 degree code-switching framework (Table 1), which utilizes Myers-Scotton's intra- and inter-sentential code-switching terms, as well as his concepts of matrix and embedded languages (1993). This model allows us to better depict "the multilingual qualities of a literary text from covert to overt manifestations, as well as from the covert usage of the embedded language (0 degree) to the use of a few foreign words (1st degree) and some sentences (2nd degree), up to a high number of embedded language units in a sentence (3rd degree) or even different languages appearing in one word (4th degree), and finally, the complete disappearance not only of the matrix language, but also of understandable words (5th degree)" (Domokos 2018: 98).

Various code-switching types

0 degree or covert, and overt c-s (ZCS)	It allows the writer to utilize or cite language as a medium without any special linguistic insertion, so the reader can better focus on the storyline.
1st degree or intra-sentential c-s (CS1)	It is characterized by the sporadic use of foreign words and tags in the sentences of the matrix language.
2nd degree or inter-sentential c-s (CS2)	It corresponds to a text that includes whole sentences or paragraphs in another language.
3rd degree blurring the border of matrix and embedded languages (CS3)	It is an intensive form of code-switching, where the matrix language is almost deconstructed.
4th degree or lexico-morphological translingualism (CS4)	It uses a high number of diverse lexical and morphological units in a word or a phrase.
5th degree or homophonic translingualism (CS5)	Homophonic and homographic elements abound

Table 1: *0 to 5 degree code-switching classification based on Domokos, 2018*

Whether in an apparently very multilingual literature such as the Sámi, or very much a population connecting to their literary tradition such as the Hungarian, in both of these cases there are plenty of examples which can be used to illustrate the code-switching classes outlined above. Therefore, below we will provide heuristic examples taken from very different literary productions of multilingual or monolingual contemporary authors.

Monolingual, bilingual, ambilingual writers

There is no national literature that does not have multilingual roots, and authors writing in multiple languages. As the scholar Till Dembeck (2017) points out, there is even no such thing as a monolingual literary text, as such. However, the normativism of modern national literatures has created a blind spot surrounding code-switching. This blind spot is easier to roll back by looking at the poetic strategies of ambilingual individuals: writers who have written different works in different languages (Kellman 2000: 19); translingual writers such as Giorgio Pressburger or Ágota Kristóf; multilingual authors such as Terézia Mora's stylistic switch, or the bilingual production of Orsolya Kalász and Gábor Gyukics. Wherever we look, it is possible to find various forms of code-switching, especially of the zero degree type. This category includes various strategies, starting with inventing a penname that sounds foreign (for example, P. Howard, invented by Jenő Rejtő) or of a transcultural identity (e.g. Attila Jász develops his Native identity in *Bölelytakaró, azaz hogyan lehetsz indián* / Buffalo hide, or how to become a Native). Other zero degree code-switching strategies include 'born translated' works (e.g. Ádám Bodor's *Sinistra körzet* / The Sinistra zone¹), self-translations, clones and alterverses (which is how the trilingual author Tzveta Sofornieva categorizes her poems), code-entanglement (e.g. allegorical poems with a different messages for the foreign censorship and for the initiated readers), or monolingual mapping of multilingual dialogues and scenes supposedly happening in various languages (as Sándor Petőfi does in *János Vitéz* / John, the Valiant or Imre Madách in his *Az ember tragédiája* / The tragedy of man). As well as some of these zero code-switching techniques, we will discuss further explicit types of code-switching.

Zero degree code-switching

Zero degree code-switching (ZCS) is a widespread writing strategy which can be found in the majority of literary works characterized by linguistic alterity. When creating their literary works, authors have to decide how to transpose the multi- and translingualism of their fictional worlds into their texts. The solution adopted is often to relate multilingual backgrounds into the language of the narratorial addressees or targeted audience, who are expected to be monolingual. These monolingualisation techniques allow the author to focus on the storyline without interrupting the linguistic linearity of the narrative and troubling the reader with the insertion of foreign tongues.

This is the case, for instance, in the internationally well-received existential drama *Az ember tragédiája* / *The Tragedy of Man*, by the 19th

1 More in Móna Dánél 2019.

Century Hungarian dramatist Imre Madách. Just like Goethe's *Faust* and many other philosophical dramas of the 19th Century and beyond, Madách's work is typified not only by encounters between people of various historical ages, social statuses and cultures, but with animals, plants and also with transcendental beings (the Lord, Lucifer and other Archangels and Cherubs).² Compositionally inspired by the Hegelian structure of thesis, antithesis, synthesis and written in the style of a lyrical drama with antiquated and accentual syllabic rhythm and rhyming lines, this historically and philosophically reflecting work has a particularly accurate third-person omniscient narrator. Since setting, religious views and discourse are of great importance to the story, this all-knowing, all-seeing and all-understanding narrator type relates the whole story monolingually, be it in Heaven, on Earth, or in the dark future. Both in the biblical and the historical scenes, the communicating agencies always address each other in a mutually intelligible verbal medium, therefore the intrinsic code-switching is presented only monolingually.

In the excerpt from the opening scene below, the dialogic partners listen carefully not only to each other's communication, which involves human and transcendental beings, but also to animals and other natural entities. As is the case in other examples taken from the same work, in their linguistic reflections the characters consider mainly the semantic level, and rarely the formal (as seen in the second question and the penultimate sentence of the quote).

ÁDÁM

Ne szólj így, Éva, meg ne szégyeníts.
Mi a hang, hogy ha nincs, ki értené?
Mi a sugár, ha szín nem fogja fel?
Mi volnék én, ha mint visszhang- s virágban,
Benned szebb létre nem feselne létem,
Melyben saját magam szerethetem?

LUCIFER

E lágy enyeltést mért is hallgatom? -
Elfordulok, másképp oly szégyen ér még,
Hogy a hideg számító értelem
Megírigylendi a gyermekkedélyt.
(*Egy madárka énekelni kezd egy közel ágon.*)

ÉVA

Hallgasd csak, Ádám, óh, mondd, érted-é
E kis bohó szerelmes énekét?

2 For a more detailed analysis of 19th century zero type code-switching through Sándor Petőfi's and Mark Twain's works see Domokos, Johanna and Deganutti, Marianna. "Overt and covert zero code switching in Sándor Petőfi's János vitéz (John the Valiant) and Mark Twain's A Tramp abroad", forthcoming.

ÁDÁM

Én a patak zugását hallgatám,
És azt találom, szintén így dalolt.

ÉVA

Minő csodás összhang ez, kedvesem,
E sokszerű szó és egy értelem³.

ADAM

Do not say that, Eve, don't put me to shame.
What's the voice when nobody understands?
And tell me what is beam without colour?
What would I be when not be mirror'd
In you, like both the echo and the flowers
In which I can adore only myself?

LUCIFER

Why do I listen to this mild flirting?
I look away otherwise I'll be ashamed:
The cold and self-seeking reasoning will
Become envious of the artless mind.
(*A tiny bird begins to sing on a twig.*)

EVE

Adam, listen to it, tell me, do you
Perceive the song of this merry lover?

ADAM

I listen'd to the babbling of the creek
And found it to sing the same merry song.

EVE

Darling, this is wonderful harmony,
These diverse words and one reason only⁴.

(translated by Otto Tomschey)

Beside hidden multilingualism, code-entanglement also refers to parallel linguistic worlds, however in the case of the former, the phenomenon is formal (as two different linguistic codes are mapped into one), and in the case of the latter one, it is semantic (as two different interpretations are incorporated in the same linguistic code). Allegorical literary works are good examples of code-entanglement, since all of them have double rhetoric; they can be interpreted to reveal a hidden meaning beside a

3 <https://mek.oszk.hu/00800/00849/html/01.htm#1> (20.09.2021)

4 <http://mek.oszk.hu/00800/00876/00876.htm> (20.09.2021)

more obvious one. Beside the main narrative or dramatic action carried out by animals, plants or even humans, there is typically a hidden moral, erotic or political message decodable mainly by a special readership. A good example of a lyrical allegory is the Hungarian folk-nationalist poet Mihály Tompa's famous poem *A madár, fiaihoz / The Bird, to his sons*. He wrote this poem in 1852, during the Habsburg dictatorship which followed the defeat of the Hungarian war of independence, when he could only communicate his true thoughts in a hidden, allegorical form. The bird talking to his chicks advises them to keep their way of life and communication alive, and not to take example from those humans who have switched codes. This is how the poem ends⁵

A bokorban itt az ősi fészek,
Mely növelte könnyü szárnyatok;
Megpihenni most is abba tértek,
Bár a fellegek közt járjatok!
S most, hogy a szél összevissza tépte:
Ugy tennétek, mint az emberek?
Itt hagynátok, idegent cserélve...?
– Fiaim, csak énekeljete!

Here in this bush your ancient home beholds.
Where first ye spread your wings; will ye not rest
After a vagrant flight through cloud aisles cold
At last, and gladly, in your former nest?
Although the wind hath rent it, will ye be
Like callous men, the wreck abandoning?
Fly not to alien shores beyond the sea.
But sing, I prithee sing!
(translated by Nora de Vallyi and Dorothy Stuart)

ZCS can be also found in works in which inspiration from other literature can lead to creating literary works with exolingual stylistic code, just as the talented contemporary prosaist Terézia Mora implements the Hungarian post-modern style to her storytelling in German in *Alle Tage / Day in, day out*, or *Der einzige Man auf dem Kontinent, The only man on the continent*. With her 2014 novel entitled *Das Ungerheur* (The Monster) her novelistic style becomes even more complex. The pages of this book are divided into two parallel narratives. The story of the male character runs in the upper part of the page and employs an engaging diversity of voices by constantly changing the focus between the characters and the primary, heterodiegetic narrator. By expertly manipulating the linguistic register and employing furiously quick changes in point

5 https://www.magyarulbabelben.net/index.php?page=work&interfaceLang=en&literatureLang=hu&translationLang=all&auth_id=664&work_id=24615&tran_id=24616&tr_id=0&tran_lang=en (09.21.2021)

of view, Mora's Hungarian reminiscent post-modern style endows the text with an unusual depth and dynamism. Meanwhile, the female character's narrative on the bottom of the page is a lyrical prose, which is a self-translation from Hungarian of notes, diary entries, translation experiments by Hungarian authors (Kassák, Nemes Nagy, Erdős and Pilinszky), and excerpts from reference books on mental illness (at the end of the book the reader is given the link to Mora's Hungarian source text⁶).

Similarly successful and innovative in zero degree code-switching is the recent poetry collection of the Hungarian poet, prosaist and essayist Imre Oravecz. In his book entitled *A hopik könyve*⁷ / *The book of the Hopi*, Oravecz creates the universe of a lyrical 'I' in the imagined spirit of a Hopi, as experienced through his reading adventure of the 1963 Frank Waters book, also entitled *The book of Hopi*. Noticing this strong inspiration, the author acknowledges it in his foreword:

... one day in early April, I suddenly put down the book, and after about a five-year break, I also unexpectedly took out paper and pen. And until then, I never wrote a poem with a characteristic good feeling ... And not so much because of the motives used, but rather because of the said good feeling, I decided to write a Hopi poem. Thus, such a kind of occasional lyrics for singing that Frank Waters's book in fact does not contain... (2019, 10, our translation)

Native inspiration is manifested differently by the Hungarian poet Attila Jász, who has systematically built himself a Native identity as Toll Csendes ('Quite Pen'). As inscribed on the cover *Bőlénytakaró, avagy hogyan lehetsz indián* / *Buffalo hide, or how to become a Native*, the authors are Attila Jász and Toll Csendes. This 2020 poetry volume describes how a dislocated *pale face* acquires his native identity during his first two decades of life spent in Central Europe, more precisely, in Hungary. Just as painted buffalo hides commemorate a tribe's historical events or the characteristics of a person, the poems divided into four cycles in the book recount biographical events from the first two decades of this lyrical 'I'. During this time, the child transits to a person with both a pale face as well as a Native identity. In Hungarian culture, the concept of Native American (Hun. *indián*) has very positive connotations, being a symbol of a person with high morals, a free spirit, a deep connection to nature, and being proficient in old tradition. To play Indián / Native is very common while growing up in Hungary, partly due to Karl May's novels, to the wilderness schools popular during the school holidays,

6 More on hidden and manifest multilingualism in Terézia Mora's work in Domokos 2016.

7 https://konyvtar.dia.hu/xhtml/oravecz_imre/Oravecz_Imre-A_hopik_konyve.xhtml (09.21.2021)

and to the deep sympathy the Hungarians, who consider themselves the Native Indians of Europe, feel towards the Native Americans. In Jász' book the language of the Native is not as much a verbal code, but it is the language of freedom, of liberation from society's conventions, especially in the perception of traumatic events. Beside using certain cultural loan words, like *tipi*, leather stoking, etc., the poetic language of the book is smoothly monolingual. While it is not explicitly told, the reader understands that everyone speaks Hungarian, even the grandmother, the only person who appears in the eyes of the child as a Native woman.

In the current Native American boom in Hungarian poetry, the 2021 anthology of *Utolsó Indiánkönyv* / The Last Indian Book, containing the homages of nearly one hundred Hungarian poets to the universal Native American spirit, the editors Gábor Gyukics, Attila Jász and Imre Wirth formulated the following call in their preface, not only to authors but also to the reader:

Are there enough Indians left in you to bring the shadows up because the Bird of Thunder takes your calling word far to blow the fire and blow the smoke out of the kalumet again toward four parts of the world? Do you address, slowly knowing everything, the Great Spirit, do you tell him that the world is closing in vain, and the richness of life of János Xántus and Ervin Baktay is just a dream...? (2021, 4, our translation)

1st and 2nd degree code-switching

Literary multilingualism could also appear in forms which dismantle the linguistic homogeneity of the narrative more evidently; this is the case of 1st and 2nd degree code-switching. These practices can be defined as the sporadic use of foreign insertions (words and tags in the case of intra-sentential code-switching, and whole sentences in the case of inter-sentential code-switching) in a still clearly recognizable matrix language. It is not unusual for these insertions to be followed by translations, explanatory notes or phrases – sometimes in a footnote or even in a short dictionary located at the end of the work. However, these insertions do not excessively trouble the linguistic homogeneity of the narrative. The assumedly monolingual reader, who could nevertheless be familiar with the culture or specific concepts of the work, is hardly fazed by these insertions as the matrix language of the narrative clearly dominates.

Intra-sentential and inter-sentential code-switching can be employed by writers for several reasons. One of these could be the fact that some words or expressions might correspond to culture-specific elements, which writers struggle to find an equivalent for in other

tongues. Another plausible reason for the switch may be related to the authors' choice to add a folkloristic or exotic trait to their works. Intra-inter-sentential code-switching could also be used to directly depict the linguistic troubles faced by a character, such as in Ferenc Karinthy's *Epepe* (1970)⁸, a novel in which ZCS, intra-sentential and inter-sentential code-switching are widely used.

The story is based on the main character Budai's linguistic mishaps in an unknown foreign country. This linguist of Hungarian origins inadvertently takes the wrong flight and instead of reaching Helsinki, where he is supposed to take part in a conference, ends up in a displacing country whose language is completely alien to him. The character is puzzled by his inability to understand people and being understood by them despite his extraordinary linguistic background, which is often underlined by the narrator.

Budai's instinct for language had been sharpened by his studies: etymology was his area of interest, the way words developed, their origins. He had to deal with the strangest languages in the course of his research, both Hungarian and Finnish in the Finno-Ugrian group, but also to some extent Vogul, Ostyak, Turkic, some Arabic and Persian, and beyond these Old Slavic, Czech, Slovakian, Polish and Serbo-Croat. The language here did not remind him of any of them, nor of Sanskrit, Hindi, Ancient or Modern Greek, nor of his High German either, for he knew German proper, as well as English and Dutch. Besides these, he was also acquainted with Latin, French, Italian, and Spanish as well as having a smattering of Portuguese, Romanian, Italian Rotoroman and a smidgeon of Hebrew, Armenian, Chinese and Japanese. Most of these he could only read to a so/so standard of course, to the point that they were useful for tracking the development of one or other words, but he knew them sufficiently well to recognize that this language did not resemble any of them (7).

Multiple times in the text, Budai seeks to interact with the locals, whose tongue sounds to him like a sequence of randomly arranged sounds, which are reported, for example, as sequences of "ededede" or "gaga-gaga" (8). The character desperately seeks to understand the language of this unknown country in order to free himself and finally return home. For instance, Budai "tried to address the receptionist in Finnish, then in English, French, German and Russian, all clearly to no avail since the man replied in a different unknown language" (31). In these

8 In the English version, the title book is translated by György Szirtes as *Metropole*. The quotes inserted in this study originate from this publication.

cases, Karinthy uses overt (indexed) ZCS, when the narrator only signals to the reader that the real language in which the story occurs in that specific passage does not correspond to the matrix language. This practice may be understood as the writer's need to specify the presence of a different tongue (with all the implications that it brings) without burdening the reader with a foreign insertion.

In *Epepe*, however, Karinthy also widely uses intra-sentential code-switching, in particular when dealing with concepts or ideas which would be difficult to translate into the matrix Hungarian. In the following passage, Budai compares the unknown language with other foreign tongues, in a desperate attempt to understand it.

He spent a whole day looking into this kind of thing, neatly noting down everything in columns for easier scrutiny. He found mostly those where only the first two or three elements were the same. Of course, he couldn't exclude the possibility that these were individual words, their resemblance merely coincidental, such as *batter* and *battle*, or like the English *six* and *sister*. But if they were root-words or syllables, exactly as he hoped they were, then what did the various agglutinations mean? Were they substantives, verbal inflections, formative syllables, notations, postpositions? Might they represent differences of gender as in the case of the French *directeur* and *directrice*? (54)

The English and French words are examples of intra-sentential code-switching. This work also offers cases of inter-sentential code-switching – insertions of whole foreign sentences – especially when the narrator refers to the incomprehensible tongue spoken in the unknown country. The following passage reports a sentence Budai heard from Pepé, a friendly girl whose job is to accompany the guests in the hotel where he is staying. By interacting with her, Budai is trying to understand how the mysterious language works.

He began by writing down the first ten numbers, hurrying out to the lift, finding Pepé, having her take him up to the top floor, then holding out the sheet of paper while pointing to the 1. It wasn't clear what the girl replied, and he was sure she hadn't understood him or what he wanted, because she laughed, lit a cigarette and shrugged her shoulder saying something like: '*Tuulli ulumúlu alaulp tleplé ...*' (93)

The opposition between ZCS used for known tongues and 2nd degree code-switching employed to express the unknown language seems to be

part of a specific narratorial strategy, activated by the writer to let the reader experience Budai's difficulties first-hand.

3rd degree code-switching

This section presents an insight into the quadrilingual poetic laboratory of Anne Tardos, where translanguaging offers great potential for the manifestation of multilingual authorship. This code-switching type blurs the boundaries between the matrix and the embedded languages, which do not appear clearly recognizable as in the types described above. New York-based Anne Tardos grew up speaking French, Hungarian, German and English. In an essay she confesses:

... when writing poetry, I don't necessarily make a point of noticing the language I'm writing in. I don't feel predominantly English speaking, even though I've lived most of my adult life in New York and am definitely most comfortable in English today ... My prerequisite for writing multilingually could be nothing more complicated than achieving a certain state of mind, creating an environment that is favorable to abandoning the barriers between languages and dealing with the rhythm, balance, harmony of the sounds, and even meaning—but without a particular focus on any language's identity⁹.

In the short poetic excerpt below, interlingual translanguaging blurs the boundaries of embedded and matrix languages and gives voice to a multilingual 'lyrical I' who unravels her thoughts on transiency. The two multilingual title words of "Ami" and "minden" can be decoded by several linguistic codes which the author consciously plays with. However, the poem will mostly be approached by readers with other referential frameworks. For example, although Tardos quite likely did not think of the small town of Minden in North Westphalia, a reader who has some knowledge about this neighborhood will definitely activate this denotation. Below you can find the original text (Hungarian, French, English, German marked accordingly) and its rough English translation.

Ami minden

Ami minden quand un yes or no je le said
viens am liebsten hätte ich dich du süßes

9 Anne Tardos, "Why I write the Way I Write" [Paper presented at Conference on Poetry and Pedagogy], Bard College, June 24-27, 1999. Updated and retitled "How not to teach Multilingual Writing", 2002., [en ligne], disponible sur URL: <http://annetardos.com/essays/hownotto.pdf>, consulté le 28 août 2019.

de ez nem baj das weisst du me a favor
hogy innen se faire croire
tous less birds als die Wälder langsam verschwinden.

Minden verschwinden, mind your step and wolf.
Verschwinden de nem innen—
je vois de void in front of mich—
je sens, als ich érzem qu'on aille, aille,
de vágy a fejem, csak éppen (eben sagte ich wie die Wälder verschwinden).

I can repeat it as a credo so it sinks into our
cerveaux und wird embedded there, mint egy teória
mathématique, “d’enchâssement” die Verankerungstheorie in
der Mathematik, hogy legalább . . .

What's all / My one and all / Friend, everything

What is all, as I said yes or no
 come on, I would rather have you, Sweetie
 but that's not a problem, you know, do me a favor
 from here make me believe
 all the / some birds as the forests slowly disappear

All disappear, watch your step and your wolf
 Disappear but not from here—
 I see the emptiness in front of me—
 I feel how I feel they go go away
 but my head a desire, just now (I just said “as the forests disappear”).

I can repeat it as a credo until it sinks into our brains,
 and there gets embedded as a mathematical theory
 of “embedding” the anchoring
 theory in mathematics,
 so that at least ...

Table 2, Anne Tardos: *Ami minden* (1991), excerpt, with our English translation

Summary

Various kinds of literary code-switching manifest in the verbal body of a literary work, including the name of the author (official and/or ethnic), the title of the book, the prologue (if any), the major text (often divided into smaller units with their own titles), as well as the epilogue (if any) and a glossary of place names and realias (as is often the case in Sámi

literature). The broader definition of literary code-switching takes into account the shifting from one linguistic code (a language, dialect or register) to another during the literary process starting with choosing the linguistic medium, throughout the writing, editing, even translating processes of the text, up to the reading and mediating of a book. The narrower interpretation of formal aspects of this aesthetic device concentrates only on its linguistic appearances on the surface of the text. However both approaches work from the verbal corpus of the literary work: the first one concentrates more on how linguistic competence of the agents from all of the narrative levels influence each other, while the second one analyzes formal, semantic and stylistic aspects in the linear manifestation of the text. However in both cases code-switching is seen as a linguistic device serving the aestheticism of the text, that arises in the process of negotiating form and meaning in relation to the normative trends and allowed artistic freedom of a specific literary community.

In this article, we have applied 0 to 3rd degree code-switching to some key Hungarian literary works, in which multilingualism is expressed in several different ways. ZCS practices confirm the possibility for apparently homogeneous texts to carry more or less visible forms of linguistic diversity. This strategy exploits the fact that while the narrators project their own use of signifiers to present the story to the reader, the latter will be empowered with understanding the story beyond his or her individual linguistic skills. 1st and 2nd degree code-switching express a foreign linguistic presence in a text more directly. These techniques are used by writers to achieve multiple aims in their works, such as to better detail specific episodes and circumstances, add a folkloristic trait or culture-specific elements which would not be easily expressed in the matrix language, let the reader directly experience another linguistic background, etc. 3rd degree code-switching dismantles linguistic homogeneity even more remarkably, sometimes calling into question the matrix language of a text. In this case, the writer might activate multiple denotations, which would be unthinkable in a monolingual work. By employing this framework, the current terminological confusion dominating the literary multilingual field is replaced by a well-structured and clear theoretical structure based on code-switching practices. Literary code-switching – in all its varieties and nuances – helps us to identify innumerable factors and connections, from the materiality of language and the narratorial strategies exploited by writers to the connections between the verbal, the poetic, and the world. The advantage of this framework also consists in the fact that it facilitates comparisons between different practices which are needed to understand the multilingual literary complexity.

Works Cited

- Arndt, Susan, Naguschewski, Dirk and Stockhammer, Robert (eds.) *Exophonie Anders-Sprachigkeit (in) der Literatur*. Kulturverlag Kadmos, 2007.
- Baldo, Michela. *Italian-Canadian Narratives of Return: Analysing Cultural Translation in Diasporic Writing*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.
- Baetens Beardsmore, Hugo. "Polyglot Literature and Linguistic Fiction." *International journal of the sociology of language*, vol.15, 1978, pp. 91-102.
- Berruto, Gaetano. "Situazioni di plurilinguismo, commutazione di codice e mescolanza di sistemi." *Babylonia*, vol. 6, no. 1, 1998, pp. 16-21.
- Blum-Barth, Nathalia. "[W]enn man schreibt, muss man [...] die anderen Sprachen aussperren.' Exkludierte Mehrsprachigkeit in Olga Grjasnowas Roman *Gott ist nicht schüchtern*." In Siller, Babara and Vlasta, Sandra (eds.) *Literarische (Mehr)Sprach-reflexionen*, Praesens Verlag, 2020, pp. 49-67.
- Callahan, Laura. *Spanish-English Codeswitching in a Written Corpus*. John Benjamins, 2004.
- Dánél, Móna. Élő regények és többnyelvű irodalomszemlélet. Thomka Beáta: Regénytápasztalat. Korélmény, hovatartozás, nyelvváltás. *Irodalomtörténet C* (2019). Vol. 1, 109-117.
- Dánél, Móna. Többnyelvűség és lokalitás. Magyar és román érintkező narratívák 1989-ről. 2020. <https://eda.eme.ro/bitstream/handle/10598/32194/EM2020--3-01-Danel.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y> (09.21.2021)
- Dánél, Móna. Akcentussal olvasni – Magyar irodalom mint a többnyelvű kulturális emlékezet közege (Bodor Ádám, Esterházy Péter). In. Földes Györgyi, Kovács Gábor, Ladányi István, Szávai Dorottya (szerk.): *Kelet-Közép-Európa mint kulturális konstrukció*. Gondolat, Budapest, 2021.
- Delabastita, Dirk and Grutman, Rainier (eds.) "Fictionalising translation and multilingualism." *Target*, vol. 20, no. 1, 2008, pp. 164-169.
- Derrida, Jacques. *Monolingualism of the Other or, The Prosthesis of Origin*. Translated By Patrick Mensah. Series: Cultural Memory In The Pres. Stanford. Stanford University Press. 1998.
- Dembeck, Till. "There Is No Such Thing as a Monolingual Text! New Tools for Literary Scholarship". *Polyphonie: Mehrsprachigkeit_Kreativität_Schreiben*, 2304-7607, 2017, <http://hdl.handle.net/10993/31641>
- de Man, Paul. "Semiology and Rhetoric." *Diacritics*, vol. 3, no. 3, 1973, pp. 27-33.
- Domokos, Johanna. „Ein ungarisches Moment deutscher Gegenwartsliteratur. Am Beispiel von Terézia Moras Prosa“. In. A. Czeglédy – E. Sepsi – Cs. Szummer (eds.): *Tükör által. Tanulmányok*

- a nyelv, kultúra, identitás témaköréből*, Budapest, KRE-L'Harmattan, 2016, 44-60.
- Domokos, Johanna. *Endangered Literature: Essays on Translingualism, Interculturality, and Vulnerability*. L'Harmattan--Károli Books, 2018.
- Domokos, Johanna. "Multilingualism in the Contemporary Finnish literature (Suomen kirjallisuus)." In Domokos, Johanna and Laakso, Johanna (eds.), *Multilingualism and Multiculturalism in Finno-Ugric literatures 2*. LIT Verlag, 2020, pp. 39-60.
- Domokos, Johanna and Deganutti, Marianna. "Overt and covert zero code switching in Sándor Petőfi's *János vitéz* (John the Valiant) and Mark Twain's *A Tramp abroad*." forthcoming.
- García, Ofelia. *Bilingual Education in the 21st century*. Wiley-Blackwell, 2009.
- Gardner-Chloros, Penelope. *Code-switching*. Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Gardner-Chloros, Penelope and Weston, Daniel. "Code-Switching and Multilingualism in Literature." *Language and Literature*, vol. 24, no. 3, 2015, pp. 182-193.
- Gove, Antonina Filonov. "Multilingualism and Ranges of Tone in Nabokov's *Bend Sinister*." *Slavic Review*, vol. 32, no. 1, 1973, pp. 79-90.
- Gramling, David. *The Invention of Monolingualism*. Bloomsbury, 2016.
- Grutman, Rainier (1999). "Besos para golpes": l'ambiguïté d'un titre hugolien". In Gauvin Lise (eds.), *Les langues du roman. Du plurilinguisme comme stratégie textuelle*. Les Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 1999, pp. 37-51.
- Grutman, Rainier. "Refraction and recognition: Literary multilingualism in translation." *Target*, vol. 18, no. 1, 2006, pp. 17-47.
- Grutman, Rainier. "Traduire l'hétérolinguisme: Questions conceptuelles et (con) Textuelles." In Motout, Marie-Annick (eds.), *Autour d'Olive Senior: hétérolinguisme et traduction*, Presses de l'Université d'Angers, 2012, pp. 49-81.
- Jørgensen, Jens Normann, Martha Sif Karrebæk, Lian Malai Madsen and Janus Spindler Møller. "Polylinguaging in Superdiversity." *Diversities*, vol. 13, no. 2, 2011, pp. 23-37.
- Karinthy, Ferenc, *Metropole*. Translated by George Szirtes. Telegram, 2008.
- Keller, Gary. "The Literary Stratagems Available to the Bilingual Chicano Writer." In Francisco Jiménez (eds.) *The Identification and Analysis of Chicano Literature*, Bilingual Press/Editorial Bilingüe, 1979, pp. 263-316.
- Kellman, Steven. *The Translingual Imagination*. University of Nebraska Press, 2000.
- Madách, Imre. *Az ember tragédiája* <https://mek.oszk.hu/00800/00849/html/> (09.21.2021)

- Madách, Imre. *The Tragedy of the Man*. Translated from the Hungarian by Ottó Tomschey. <http://mek.oszk.hu/00800/00876/00876.pdf> (09.21.2021)
- Milroy, Lesley and Muysken, Pieter. "Introduction: Code-Switching and Bilingualism Research." In Milroy, Lesley and Muysken, Pieter (eds.) *One Speaker, Two Languages: Cross-Disciplinary Perspectives on Code-Switching*, Cambridge University Press, 1995, pp. 1-14.
- Myers-Scotton, Carol. *Social Motivation for Code-Switching: Evidence from Africa*. Clarendon, 1993.
- Oravecz, Imre. *A hopik könyve*. https://konyvtar.dia.hu/xhtml/oravecz_imre/Oravecz_Imre-A_hopik_konyve.xhtml (09.09.2021)
- Radaelli, Giulia (2011). *Literarische Mehrsprachigkeit: Sprachwechsel bei Elias Canetti und Ingeborg Bachmann*. Akademie Verlag, 2011.
- Sebba, Mark. "Multilingualism in written discourse: An approach to the analysis of multilingual texts." *International Journal of Bilingualism*, vol. 17, no. 1, 2013, pp. 97–118.
- Sternberg, Meir. "Polylingualism as reality and translation as mimesis." *Poetics Today*, vol. 2, no. 4, 1981, pp. 221-239.
- Tardos, Anne "Why I write the Way I Write" [Paper presented at Conference on Poetry and Pedagogy], Bard College, June 24-27, 1999. Updated and retitled "How not to teach Multilingual Writing", 2002., [en ligne], disponible sur URL: <http://annetardos.com/essays/hownotto.pdf>, consulté le 2
- Tardos, Anne. *Ami minden* (1991) <https://www.jstor.org/stable/24515198> (09.09.2021)
- Thomka, Beáta: *Regénytapszlat. Korélmény, hovatartozás, nyelváltás*. Kijárat Kiadó, Budapest, 2018.
- Tompá Mihály *A madár, fiaihoz / The Bird to his Sons*. https://www.magyarulbabelben.net/works/hu-all/Tompá_Mih%C3%A1ly-1817 (09.09.2021)
- Yildiz, Yasemin. *Beyond the Mother Tongue: The Postmonolingual Condition*. Fordham UP, 2012.

Authors' profile:

Marianna Deganutti is a literary researcher interested in literary multilingualism, code-switching, borderland writers (in particular writers from or operating in Trieste) and comparative literature. She studied in Italy, Slovenia and the UK. She holds a DPhil (PhD) in Modern Languages at the University of Oxford. Her thesis was published in 2018 by Legenda with the title Fulvio Tomizza: 'Writing the Trauma of Exile'. From 2016 to 2018 she was a Research Associate at the Department of Politics, Languages & International Studies of the University of Bath, where she worked for the Horizon 2020-funded project UNREST (Unsettling remembering and social cohesion in transnational Europe). She is now affiliated with the Goethe University

in Frankfurt. Her current research project focuses on literary multilingualism and trauma studies. Her second monograph entitled 'Literary Multilingualism at the Borderlands' will be published by Routledge in 2023. E-mail: mariannadeganutti5@gmail.com

Johanna Domokos is a comparative literary scholar of indigenous cultures and minority literatures with expertise in Scandinavian and Central European areas (esp. Sámi, Finnisch, German and Hungarian). After her studies in Altaistics, Finno-Ugristics (University of Szeged), Hungarian and English Studies (University of Cluj), and Semiotics (TU Berlin), she wrote her PhD (1999, University of Szeged) and *Venia Legendi* (2011, Eötvös Loránd University Budapest) on the translatability and multicultural dynamism of Sámi literature. She is author of four monographs related to Sámi literature, edited more than twenty books. Her latest monography is entitled as *Endangered Literature*, including essays on literary interculturalism, translanguaging and vulnerability. After teaching at various universities around the world (e.g. University of Berlin, UCLA, Bielefeld University), she is currently affiliated with Gáspár Károli University of the Hungarian Reformed Church in Budapest. She is also coordinating Gruppe B^{ic} Translation and Book Production Laboratory at Bielefeld University. E-mail: johanna.domokos@uni-bielefeld.de